

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ח – כל הבשר

דף קיד – Daf 114

1. **to cook a גדי in its older sister's milk, and a mother in her own milk**

A Baraisa *darshens* a superfluous "בחלב אמו" to prohibit cooking a גדי's meat in the milk of cows and ewes, rather than only its mother's milk. This cannot be derived from a *kal vachomer* (based on their prohibition to be mated with a goat, in contrast to its mother), because its mother has its own stringency, in being forbidden to be *shechted* on the same day as her kid. The Gemara proceeds to derive from a *צד השוה* that it is also forbidden to cook a גדי's meat בחלב אמו – *in the milk of its older sister* (i.e., born in a different year), *which cannot enter the pen with it to be tithed*. Although it cannot be derived from the mother alone, because of the stringency of אמו ואת בנו, nor from cows and ewes alone, which are prohibited to be mated with a גדי, together they teach that no milk and meat can be cooked together. Another superfluous "בחלב אמו" is eventually *darshened* to prohibit cooking [the mother's] *own meat in her milk*. Rav Ashi ultimately explains that it cannot be derived from cooking a גדי in its mother's milk, *שכן שני גופים* – *which are two separate bodies*, in contrast to cooking the mother in her own milk, *שכן גוף אחד* – *which are of one body*.

2. **Rebbe Abahu's Principle for deriving any benefit from בשר בחלב (לא יאכל...)**

Rav Ashi provides a source for the prohibition against eating בשר בחלב. The *passuk* says: *you shall not eat any abomination*, meaning: *כל שתעבתי לך הרי הוא בבל תאכל* – *anything I have made abominable for you by forbidding it is included in the prohibition, "you shall not eat."* The prohibition against deriving any benefit from it is derived from Rebbe Abahu's principle: *כל מקום שנאמר לא יאכל לא תאכל לא תאכלו* – *wherever it says in the Torah "one shall not eat," "you (singular) shall not eat," or "you (plural) shall not eat," אחד איסור אכילה ואחד איסור הנאה* – *both a prohibition against eating and a prohibition against benefit are implied*, עד שיפרוט לך הכתוב כדרך – *unless the passuk specifies that benefit is permitted, as it specified for you regarding neveilah*, permitting gifting or selling it to a non-Jew (thus permitting benefit from נבלה). This implies that unless specified, a prohibition against "eating" also prohibits any benefit.

3. **Machlokes if נבלה can only be gifted to a גר or sold to an idolator, or can be gifted and sold to both**

A *passuk* says regarding a *neveilah*: *לגר אשר בשעריך תתננה ואכלה או מכור לנכרי* – *to the [non-Jewish] resident alien who is within your gates you shall give it that he may eat it, or sell it to a gentile*. Rebbe Meir says it may also be sold to a גר, because the *passuk* can be read: *לגר...תתננה או מכור* – *to a גר you shall give it or sell it*. It may also be gifted to an idolator, because the *passuk* can be read: *תתננה...או מכור לנכרי* – *you shall give it or sell it to a gentile*. Rebbe Yehudah disagrees and says: *דברים ככתבן* – *the words should be understood as they are written*, that it may only be gifted to a גר, or sold to an idolator. If Rebbe Meir were correct, the Torah should have written "you shall give it and sell it..."; the word "או" – *or* indicates that each option is specific to that respective person. Rebbe Meir replies that "או" teaches *להקדים נתינה דגר למכירה דעובד כוכבים* – *to give precedence to gifting to a גר over selling to an idolator*. Rebbe Yehudah says this is self-evident, since regarding the *גר*, *אתה מצווה להחיותו* – *you are obligated to sustain him*, unlike an idolator.

Siman – Kiddie Park

The new *kiddie park* בחלב אמו that had various types of milk hoses to demonstrate that **all milk is assur with meat such as the milk of the gedi's older sister**, had a roped off **בשר בחלב** snacking section because **if you can't eat there you can't even benefit from sitting there**, and a vendor **gifting נבלה to geirim and selling it to נכרים**.



The new kiddie park that had various types of milk hoses to demonstrate that all milk is *assur* with meat such as the milk of the *gedi*'s older sister, had a roped off *בשר בחלב* snacking section because if you can't eat there you can't even benefit from sitting there, and a vendor gifting to *נבלה* to *geirim* and selling it to *נכרים*.

3 things to remember

1. *איסור* to cook a *גדי* in its sister's milk, and a mother in her own milk
2. Rav Ashi's source for *איסור* *בשר בחלב*: of the *הנאה* and *אכילה* כל שתעבתי לך הרי הוא בבל תאכל
3. *Machlokes* if *נבלה* can only be gifted to a *גר* or sold to an idolator, or also vice versa

